

Developing a Study-Site on Witnessed Presence

Caroline Nevejan
Delft Technical University
nevejan@xs4all.nl

Abstract

This paper reports about the development of the study-site www.being-here.net, which unfolds research and insight into Witnessed presence from a variety of traditions and disciplines. Three design experiments are described. Also the three research tracks that constitute the initial body of knowledge into Witnessed Presence on the being-here site are discussed. The study-site www.being-here.net will be launched at ISPR 2011 International Workshop on Presence conference to be held at Edinburgh Napier University in Edinburgh, Scotland, October 26-28 2011.

Keywords: presence, witness, trust, design, art, e-learning, publishing, interdisciplinary, tacit knowledge.

1. Introduction

This paper reports about an experimental ‘study-site’ into Witnessed Presence. Mediated communication is used by millions of people and as a result human beings have found new ways to format their presence for each other and establish communication in a variety of trustworthy ways. With the acceptance of Internet and mobile technologies, trade-offs for presence and trust are changing rapidly. An on-going study focuses on how trade-offs are changing. Artists, academics and experts from a variety of professions have been asked to reflect on being witness and bearing witness in the merging technological, social and biological realities.

Witnessed presence, other than social presence or co-presence, is concerned with human’s capacity to take responsibility for words that are spoken and actions that are performed [1]. Having a judicial connotation for most, witnessed presence also refers to how the performance of presence is influenced by others, shaping the strive for well-being and survival from an ethical perspective [2][3]. The relation between presence and trust is fundamental to Witnessed Presence. Trade-offs are dependent upon each other [4]. The YUTPA framework is fundamental to this research [5]. It addresses the dimensions of time, place, action and relation, to analyze and design technologies of communication. YUTPA is the acronym for *Being with You in Unity of Time, Place and Action*, referring to face-to-face embodied communication. This is the original configuration

of communication, in which presence and trust are deeply interlinked. This study is discovering that tacit knowledge on the performance of presence and the establishment of trust in merging reality is widespread, yet not often made explicit.

The study-site Being-Here unfolds new insights into witnessed presence and is designed to provide committed readers and contributors the possibility to construct new knowledge themselves. It is a study environment for students and professionals in engineering and design, challenging them to include human presence, in all of its complexity. During the on-going design of Being-Here hand picked artists, academics and experts in specific fields have been invited to contribute to the site. All of these contributors share reflections on this site on how human’s capacity to be witness and bear witness to each other is affected by the use of technology. Each author’s contribution can be seen in its own right and each author’s contribution can be seen in relation to other contributions. Readers and contributors are challenged to make new meaningful connections. These authors, but also students, who have been invited to use the site in design processes in a different context, have developed different perspectives on their own work through confrontation with other author’s reflections.

Foundational to the design of the study-site into Witnessed Presence is design experiment Dissertation 2.0. This is described in paragraph 2.1. To create the interdisciplinary study-site Being-Here, three research tracks are undertaken parallel to the iterative design process of the study-site. Section 3 discusses the three research tracks. Section 4 focuses on the iterative design process of the study-site Being-Here. Section 5 describes a pilot with EU students in the being-here. The last section, section 6 sketches future research and design experiments.

2. Design Experiment 1: ‘Dissertation 2.0’

Dissertation 2.0 has been developed in the content management system AnyMeta, created by Mediamatic Lab in Amsterdam. This content management system supports the ability to design a system from a semantic and editorial viewpoint, challenging authors to be sharp and clear. The format of the site consists of articles, containing text and image. Matching is defined by metadata. The articles are gathered in sets. “Everything is a thing that links to other things” is the line with which Mediamatic Lab describes the structure of the software [6].

The first exercises in using the AnyMeta system in academic context date from 2007 and 2008. Every paragraph of the complete dissertation *Presence and the Design of Trust* has been loaded into a database and given metadata [5]. An overall structure has been made that mirrored the book to make the structure of chapters and sections available on the site. All text of the dissertation, and no extra text, constitutes the content of the experimental site dissertation 2.0.

Home | Iterative process | [Presence](#) | Galactic Hacker Party | Sero-positive Ball | Thinking Actor | YUTPA | Bibliography | Log in | Search

Presence and the Design of Trust



description, concept, definition

CAROLINE NEVEJAN

PRESENCE, A SCIENCE OF TRADE-OFFS

chapter 2

Through the use of media people try to overcome the boundaries of time and place to which our physical bodies are bound. With the development of information and communication technologies over the centuries it became possible to experience distinctions between synchronous and asynchronous communication and between physical and non-physical communication.

PRESENCE AND ABSENCE

Journaalstuk chapter 2
Communication models of 'one to one', of 'one to many' and of 'many to many' evolved. The term 'virtual' was introduced when digital ...

PRESENCE RESEARCH

Presence Research is not a formal academic discipline, but it is a field of study in the sense that presence researchers know how to ...

MEDIATED PRESENCE

Human beings have been mediating presence for as long as humanized exist. When moving around people leave trails of footprints, notes ...

Conclusion chapter 2

Communication processes between people are defined by a pattern of the presence and absence of their natural and mediated presences. The ...

PRESENCE TECHNOLOGIES

The development of sign systems, creating games, script, drawing, painting and the later development of mechanical reproduction ...

NATURAL PRESENCE

Presence as a phenomenon is, in the first instance, associated with being physically present. Our natural presence is defined by our ...

WITNESSED PRESENCE

The perceived presence of a person plays a crucial role in the social organization of communities. In a street, in a village, in a ...

Figure 1: Mirroring the structure of a book

The need for the concept of *units of meaning* surfaced during these exercises. A *unit of meaning* functions on its own and invites a reader to explore its meaning. The challenge in designing metadata is to find the most appropriate length of the *units of meaning*. Units of meaning are namely the units with which matching is implemented and significance assigned. A text fragment in chapter 1 for example may match a text fragment of chapter 4 and chapter 6. Finding the appropriate size of *units of meaning* is crucial for matching to make sense.

Home | Iterative process | [Presence](#) | Galactic Hacker Party | Sero-positive Ball | Thinking Actor | YUTPA | Bibliography | Log in | Search

Presence and the Design of Trust



description, argument, collective history

CAROLINE NEVEJAN

Conversation

People, who are not part of a profession, hardly ever realize how thinking is a part of everyday routine in a certain practice. We may recognize a master or an amateur; we recognize the end results of different practices. But we do not comprehend how the different methodologies that are developed by the great variety of practices are actually shaped; we do not really understand how thinking in the diversity of practices actually evolves.

In every professional practice people share experiences in various formal meetings within organizations. There are also moments when one reflects upon what takes place informally: during a coffee break with colleagues, coming home and sharing success or frustration with one's family and friends. These kinds of conversations are often not looked upon as generators of knowledge because they are usually coloured by emotions. In the previous section I elaborated upon the fact that emotions contain important information for survival and well-being. This is precisely why they are necessary in processes of contextual reflexivity. To generate knowledge, conversation must take place and the emotions that form part of these conversations need to be contextualized. How to deal with new situations, with changed conditions and how to build knowledge from the variety of experiences, are questions that are a part of conversation in many places. Also, in what seems a standard procedure, situations change: new policies and accountability procedures are implemented, clients change, markets develop, organizations are reorganized.

On a basic level, in a large organization, a small company or in personal lives, the work of an actor is dependent upon the work of other actors. The success of an actor's work, which is the accomplishment of an act, is also dependent upon how one is capable as an actor of

Conversation, Reflexivity, Witness, Duration, Attribution, Intention, Interpretation, Time, Perception, Cybernetics, Day-to-day, Emotion, Similar...

Experience changes physical being

The fact that experiences change children's physical well-being has been agreed on in child psychology and in pedagogy for several ...

Not-You is information (biased or not)

I can be with my lover, leave the house and pass a 'bump' and not even notice this person. Where did all my love go? When I am alone in ...

Contextual Reflexivity

In 1989 and 1990 the basic structures for producing networked events were not clear at all. I assume that this is why the notion of ...

I and Thou, You and not-You

In this section I want to argue that the way we are witnessed and witness other people, deeply influences the perception of our ...

Techno-biography

In Science and Technology Studies (STS) actors are taken extremely seriously and are often the centre of attention in

Figures 2: One unit of meaning, matching with others.

An important result of this experiment is that surfing through the dissertation has shown to be possible and experienced by students as pleasurable. Most remarkable

though was principal investigator's unexpected outcome that the dissertation 2.0 offers new perspectives on her own writing. Because the principal investigator is the author of the text and metadata, a coherence in thinking unfolds which cannot be perceived otherwise. It is the effect of hearing one's voice on a recording, which is very different than the personal experience of one's voice. Authoring metadata, and not generating them automatically, creates new avenues of meaning and offers possibilities for reflection that are otherwise not available. This exploratory work can be seen at www.being-here.net/dissertation

3. Three parallel research tracks

The next challenge in this design research is to create a study site, Being-Here, focusing on unfolding the work of a variety of authors from different disciplines. Parallel to building the site, a body of knowledge is being developed with hand-picked contributors from the arts, academia and the professional realm. The process of constructing this initial body of knowledge for the Being-Here site is different in all three traditions of art, academia and the professional realm. Actually each tradition required a separate methodology to access its knowledge and insight, which are discussed below.

3. 1. Exploratory research into Experience

To explore 'witnessed presence' 20 interviews are carried out in the Netherlands, the UK and in India with the principal investigator in filmed dialogues. Interviews are carried out with designers, social scientists, engineers, artists and business developers. Most of the people interviewed are fluent in more than one professional language and have a rich experience on which their insights and skills are based. The in-depth interviews have a very open character taking the experience and expertise of the interviewed people as perspective. The concept of witnessing and presence is explored. Each of the 4 dimensions of the YUTPA framework, Time, Place Action and Relation, are addressed in relation to trust in today's global networked society and expert's experience in day-to-day live. The interviews focus on how communication and practice differ "with the use of technology" and "without the use of technology".

Taking full responsibility for the developing conversation, these interviews can be read as testimonies in which experts bear witness to current ICT's impact on their lives and practices. Experiences, understanding and imagination are explored. As the principal investigator is 'host' to experts' testimonies, the influence of the principal investigator is significant. The constructive process of 'thinking interviews' is the basis for the formulation of a new body of knowledge.

All interviews are filmed, tracing the lines of reasoning and emergence of new concepts. Because all of the

interviews are filmed, there is a limited amount of time in which the performance of 'thinking together' has to take place. The performance element due to the presence of the camera and cameraman, contributes to the concentrated effort that is made. Another reason for filming the interviews is the spatiotemporal trajectories that cannot be translated into language as such. The wide-angle filmed material of the interviews provides an impression of the way the people interviewed move and gesticulate while being deeply involved in expressing their views. The units of meaning on the www.being-here.net site are extracted from extensive summaries. The dialogues themselves proved to be too fragmented or too lengthy to be used for this purpose. Original filmed material and transcriptions can be accessed at: www.systemsdesign.tbm.tudelft.nl/witness

As a result of this research track, factors have been identified in each dimension of the YUTPA framework, which significantly affect the making of trade-offs [7][8]. The following factors for making trade-offs are identified: Time: duration of engagement, integrating rhythm, synchronizing performance, making moments to signify Place: body sense, material interaction, situated agency, emotional space Relation: communion, engagement, reputation, use Action: tuning, reciprocity, negotiation, use

3.2 Academic Research

Following standard academic practice, academic contributions for www.being-here.net have been gathered in a special issue on Witnessed Presence with AI & Society, Journal for Knowledge, Culture and Communication (Springer) [9]. In the call authors are invited to explore the notion of witnessing in submissions to the journal. Eleven contributions from scholars from a variety of disciplines have been accepted: from the disciplines philosophy, literature, art history, architecture, cultural studies, cognitive psychology, sociology, business administration, computer science and design. In the Fall of 2011 papers are to be published online, the printed issue will appear early 2012. Due to copyright infringements, only a number of the papers can be fully published in the Being-Here site, the abstracts of the other papers are included on the site.

This special issue concludes that witnessing is fundamental to being-in-the-world [10]. Presence research needs to include the complex dynamics of the *in-between* space that constitutes witnessing [11]. Different authors argue that intention, availability, addressability, embodiment, representation, culture, imagination, and fictional presence are fundamental to witnessed presence. Only when being and bearing witness to each other is fully facilitated, will social structures of the future offer an environment in which human beings can survive and be well.

3.3 Artistic Research

In addition to contributing to the interviews, a number of artists have been invited to make autonomous work and reflect on this work in their contribution to the Being-Here site [12]. Artist's work not only had to be interesting from the viewpoint of the principal investigator, also artists themselves had to be interested to partake in exploring academic research.

Every artist is asked to address the same question: "What happens when one is witness to another". After an introductory meeting, artists take time to think and make first sketches. These are discussed with the principal investigator, who mostly asked questions of clarification. Also the principal investigator points artists to contributions of other authors that may be of interest to the work at hand. During the creation process the principal investigator met three times with each artist to discuss concepts and the best way to present the work on the site. In groups of 4 special dinners have been held to stimulate and exchange ideas.

While placing the works and reflections on the being-here site, conversations about metadata between artists and the principal investigator are thoughtful and valuable. Metadata are discussed with authors, but are determined by the principal investigator.

The screenshot shows the user interface of the Being-Here website. At the top, there is a navigation bar with the name 'Carolina Heerjan' and options for 'Contributions' and 'Preferences'. Below this is a search bar and a list of categories: 'Witnessed Presence', 'Time', 'Place', 'Action', and 'Relation'. The main content area displays a list of contributions by Ronald Ophuis, each with a title, a small image, and a brief description. The contributions listed are:

- Ronald Ophuis: Fiction is part of witnessing**: Ronald Ophuis verdiept zich in zijn werk in een enkele handeling, soms wekenlang. De scènes die hij uiteindelijk schildert verbeelden vaak momenten van wanhoop, verdriet, geweld, van het breken ...
- Methods for painting**: My work consists of the creating and painting of fictitious events. I stage the drama in my studio. Actors playing and reconstructing the scene in front of a camera. Before I start I do my research ...
- Testimonies**: In 1992 a transport plane crashed into two blocks of flats in the district Bijlmermeer in Amsterdam. Dozens of people were killed. Although no one filmed the actual crash, there was only footage of ...
- Why do we give fictitious testimony?**: The testimonies may be fictitious but the sentiments we have experienced are not. As a means to call up emotions they are not necessarily untrue. Is it possible to form a social community as ...
- Interrogation of the soul**: As a child I often looked at the images from the life of Christ during mass. Above the altar a crucified Christ was hung and in the mid of last century a beautiful Stations of the Christ was painted ...
- Thoughts**: In what situation do we compare up fictitious images. When does our visual phantasy starts to work. At night in our dreams. When we're having sex. When we're tormented with visions of fear. ...
- The Game**: Compare it to the games children play. They play war games, play ...

Carolina Nevejan Contributions Preferences log out

Visible to: everybody


Witnessed Presence Time Place Action Relation

Research Design Experience Art Academia Dissertations Students Workshops

Search

Luna Maurer — Enjoying networks

Luna Maurer is a designer and artist working on human input in structured processes.



Luna Maurer at Flux-5

www.poly-luna.com
www.poly-xelor.com
www.conditonaldesign.org

Collapsable section

Playful users and intelligent systems

Luna Maurer
Online publication: Conversation as a play with rules: Three short dialogues between Luna Maurer and Andreas Zangger on the interaction of humans and machines, on designing systems, and on participation of the users.

In these dialogues we try to bring in the questions and experiences arising in the context of our work. Luna Maurer is a designer and artist working in the field of digital media. Andreas Zangger is historian of science and of transnational networks.

The work of Luna Maurer serves as a bracket for the dialogue. The dialogues are inspired by the idea of conditional design that is at the centre of Luna Maurer's work. They are based on chats on Skype. There were rules for the chat, e.g. we had to wait for an answer. The speed of the chat was thus utterly reduced. Afterwards they were edited and grouped by topics. Each of the dialogues has a general topic: the first deals with the

Artists report that presenting their work in this context is very inspirational because it offers them unexpected connections and new insights in their own work.

Currently this research track is in its final phase, analysis still has to take place. It is clear though that artists show different complexities in trade-offs human beings make

4. Design experiment 2: developing Being-Here

Having the ambition to create a site in which people can surf and can also decide to focus on a single author's contribution only, two requirements are formulated. The work of each author can be seen on its own right, and matching between authors has to make sense. The site has to offer a linear and an associative view. The matching on paragraph level between different authors from different disciplines demands a strong editorial structure in which context is provided. Only in context does matching of *units of meaning* make sense. Therefore, in all views, links to linear and associative view are available. One can switch between views on every level. Also, in all views, links to collections of distinct authors are made and traditions of art, experience and academia are shown.

Carolina Nevejan Contributions Preferences log out

Visible to: everybody

Witnessed Presence Time Place Action Relation

Research Design Experience Art Academia Dissertations Students Workshops

Search

< While news passed away Embedded in a cocoon >


< From a water purifier to a whole water eco-system Experiment II: dissolving glass in water >

Kadir van Lohuizen

Climate refugees in Drowned Land

Edit Collect this article

Drowned land, its cold, very cold in Bangladesh, especially if you only wear a Sari. I am arriving with a small boat in the early morning, I feel lost in this world at the same time it reminds me so much of Holland; flat, everywhere water. I am climbing the embankment, it is very slippery with the wet riverly. I don't have boots and almost lose my shoes.



bangladesh011_0004

Till two years ago this was all agricultural land, then cyclone Aila arrived, unannounced. There was hardly any wind, just a big wave. Cyclones are nothing new for Bangladesh. What is new is that the water doesn't recede, the sea is rising, so are the rivers due to the fast melting of the glaciers in the Himalaya's.

Now mother and son live on a small island, surrounded by water. They are two of the millions of climate refugees in Bangladesh.

January 2011

< While news passed away Embedded in a cocoon >

< From a water purifier to a whole water eco-system Experiment II: dissolving glass in water >

Fans
Schaadten Moltzheim

Part of
Research & Development
Research & Development to develop tomorrow's technical solutions

Only Problems with Water?

Kadir van Lohuizen: Being witness for bearing witness
Kadir van Lohuizen travels physically to places to be witness and make images beyond and besides the news. These visual testimonies...

Keywords
Body, Witness, Well-being, Survival, Rural, Things go wrong, Scale, Evolution, Emergence, Place (here/not-here), Similar

Related things: Art
perception, concept, methodology, technography

Witnessing your own steps
Zeno Fögl - The container was the first place I started. I built a small container of wood to see what a container essentially is. Then, after L...

Onshore/Offshore
Zeno Fögl - These containers are meant for cargo, not for people. In the container a light bulb was hanging on a long piece of wire. It slowly...

Related things: Experience
interview, practice, theory

Decent systems under the rule of law
Inge van der Vlies by CN - Human beings negotiate between inner values and external values. Like the law, also system engineering creates a relation between...

Sharing sensual reality
interview, description, concept, practice

Rein Janema by CN - Zwarts & Janema have made a lot of sports buildings but actually, according to Janema, a soccer stadium is a very silly building...

Destroying and seeding art
Angelo Vermeulen - Each Biomodell made with the Biomodell...

In the Being-Here site *units of meaning*, named articles in AnyMeta, are identified for every author's contributed collection of work and these are appointed metadata. Visitors and contributors are invited to access the gathered contributions in multiple ways. Visitors of this site can follow linear lines of authored content and can surf according to personal interest. Distinctions between the different traditions to which authors have committed themselves (art, academia, professional knowledge and student work) are made through out.

As the body of knowledge has grown so has the editorial menu. The editorial menu, written by the principal investigator summarizes insights into Witnessed Presence, Time, Place, Action and Relation acquired during the development of the site. Below this editorial text, work of authors is dynamically generated on the basis of *units of meaning*.

Currently the initial body of knowledge is in its last editorial stages. The site has been not been indexed in search engines, nor could it be accessed by external parties. The site is to be launched at the ISPR 2011 – International Society for Presence Research Annual Conference. After it is indexed and people can sign on.

The screenshot shows the 'Being-Here' website interface. At the top, there is a navigation bar with 'Caroline Nevejan', 'Contributions', and 'Preferences'. Below this is a search bar and a list of categories: Research Design, Experience, Art, Academia, Dissertations, Students, Workshops. The main content area is titled 'Tuning' and contains a grid of article thumbnails. Each thumbnail includes a title, a small image, and a brief description. The articles are arranged in a grid with three columns and several rows. The first row includes 'Rhythm and feeling', 'Scales of time', and 'Synchronizing rhythms'. The second row includes 'Witnessed witness: Altering thickness of glass affects perception', 'Changes and rhythms in computers, plants and people', and 'Entrainment and Rhythm'. The third row includes 'Presence as connection', 'Going in circles', and 'Body and breathing are key'. The fourth row includes 'YUTPA in systems', 'Connecting rhythms', and 'Tracking time'. The fifth row includes 'Orchestrating negotiation', 'Connecting time', and 'Projects of survival'. The sixth row includes 'The biomimicry', 'Reflexions about the biomimicry', 'Sharing Rhythm is required for witnessing to take place', and 'Rhythm essential for well being'.

5. Design Experiment 3: Presence Workshop in Being- Here

In March 2011 an experiment for using Being-Here as a study-site has been conducted. Manually the site has been adapted to receive the students. In a one-week workshop of the EU Athens Program 20 European engineering and design students used the Being-Here site as a catalyst in design processes. Being in each others' physical presence students use the site to document their own design processes as well as their shared design processes. Different moments of presentation have been orchestrated in this process. The confrontation and inspiration of existing contribution on the site, challenge them to increase their own performance: writing and editorial skills improve, imagination becomes more complex.

Students report that they like working on the site, and appreciate the concentrated attention that is needed to be able to contribute, once they are forced to sit and write. The structure of the site, which allows them to gather elements of the initial body of knowledge, is shown to be inspirational. Also, because 'everything is a thing' individual contributions could be linked to the group work they contribute. Individual performances are seen in the context of shared work. This functionality is much appreciated by students. The result of the student's work is highly graded by professors of Delft Technical University.

6. Future research en design experiments

Currently new research designs are being formulated along the lines of the being-here site. Unfolding presence design in all of its complexity, special attention is directed towards designing new services for supporting ecological sustainable futures. Future focus will be on witnessing, presence and trust in the context of designing new ecological social technical structures.

The structure of the site is to grow into a next phase, incorporating the work of more students and professionals and allowing visitors to contribute. Social network features will be added in a minimalistic way. The site needs to remain a study-site, but as knowledge emerges in social interaction, future experiments will also focus on the social functionality needed in a study-site.

Acknowledgements

Author thanks Mediamatic Lab for supporting the initial phase of the research and Frances Brazier, Thomas Quillinan and Leen de Baat for their personal support. Financial support: The Netherlands Foundation for Visual Arts, Design, Stichting NLnet, VU University. Delft Technical University

References

- [1] Nevejan Caroline. 2009. Witnessed presence and the YUTPA framework. In PsychNology Journal 'Ethics in Presence and Social Presence Technology', volume 7 (1). www.psychnology.org
- [2] Riva, Giuseppe, John A. Waterworth and Eva L. Waterworth. 2004. The Layers of Presence: A Bio-cultural Approach to Understanding Presence in Natural and Mediated Environments. In *CyberPsychology & Behavior* (7) 4: 402-416.
- [3] Damasio, Antonio. 2004. *Looking for Spinoza, Joy, Sorrow and the Feeling Brain*. London: Vintage, Random House
- [4] IJsselsteijn, Wijnand A., 2004. *Presence in Depth*, PhD diss., Technische Universiteit Eindhoven.
- [5] Nevejan Caroline. 2007. *Presence and the Design of Trust*. PhD diss., University of Amsterdam <http://www.anymeta.net/>
- [6] Nevejan, Caroline & Brazier, Frances, 2010. *Witnessed Presence in Merging Realities in Healthcare Environments*. In: *Advanced Computational Intelligence Paradigms in Healthcare 5*, *Studies in Computational Intelligence*, 2011, Volume 326/2011, 201-227, Springer
- [8] Nevejan, Caroline & Brazier, Frances, 2011. *Granularity in Reciprocity*. In: special issue *Witnessed Presence, AI & Society*, *Journal for Knowledge, Culture and Communication*. Springer.
- [9] Nevejan, Caroline & Gill, Satinder eds. 2012. *Special issue Witnessed Presence, AI & Society*, *Journal for Knowledge, Culture and Communication*. Springer
- [10] Turner, Phil. 2011. *An Everyday account of Witnessing*. In: special issue *Witnessed Presence, AI & Society*, *Journal for Knowledge, Culture and Communication*. Springer.
- [11] Gill, Satinder. 2011. *Rhythmic Synchrony and Mediated Interaction: towards a framework of rhythm in embodied interaction*. In: special issue *Witnessed Presence, AI & Society*, *Journal for Knowledge, Culture and Communication*. Springer. Advising curators: Willem Velthoven en Suzanne Oxenaar
- [12]